Addressing Implicit Bias in the Pre-K–8 Classroom

Walter S. Gilliam, PhD
Edward Zigler Center in Child Development & Social Policy
Yale University Child Study Center

Twitter: @WalterGilliam

Webinar Wednesday
National Association of Elementary School Principals
February 12, 2020
Expulsion Rates (per 1,000)

- K-12: 2.1
- PreK: 6.7
- Child Care: 27.4


The Preschool to Prison Pipeline


Child Care Expulsion Rates

Child Rates

- Detroit, MI (Grannan et al., 1999; n=127; 28%)
  - Rate = 28/1,000
- Massachusetts (Gilliam & Shahar, 2006; n=119; 64%)
  - Rate = 27/1,000 (39% Classes)
- Massachusetts (MA DOE, 2003; n=764; ?%)
  - Rate = 2% expelled; 1% “suggested,” 1% transferred
- Colorado (Hoover, 2006; n=1,075; 17%)
  - Rate = 10/1,000

Center/Classroom Rates

- Illinois (Cutler & Gilkerson, 2002; n=195 I/T; 38%)
  - Rate = 42% of Centers
- Alaska (Alaska CCPO, 2005; n=493; 71%)
  - Rate = 35% Centers
Factors Predicting Preschool Expulsion

**Child-Teacher Ratio**

- Under 8: 7.7%
- 8 to 9: 9.8%
- 10 to 11: 10.5%
- 12 and Up: 12.7%

**Program Length of Day**

- Half-Day: 7.1%
- School-Day: 9.0%
- Extended-Day: 13.2%

**Teacher Job Stress**

- Low Stress: 4.9%
- Average Stress: 9.3%
- High Stress: 14.3%

**Access to Behavioral Supports**

- No Access: 14.3%
- On-Call Access: 10.3%
- On-Site Access: 8.0%
Preschool Expulsion Is NOT a Child Behavior.

It’s an Adult Decision.
Who Gets Expelled?

4-year-olds 50% more likely than 3’s

Black preschoolers more than 2 times as likely as white preschoolers

Boys more than 4 times as likely as girls
The 3 B’s of Expulsion Risk

- BIG
- BLACK
- BOY
US Department of Education
Office of Civil Rights (2014, 2016)

http://ocrdata.ed.gov

March 2014 (2011-2012 data)
- “Black children make up 18% of preschool enrollment, but 48% of preschool children suspended more than once.”
- “Boys receive more than three out of four out-of-school preschool suspensions.”

June 2016 (2013-2014 data)
- Black preschoolers 3.6 times as likely to be suspended as white preschoolers
- Blacks represent 19% of preschoolers, but 47% of suspensions
- Boys represent 54% of preschoolers, but 78% of suspensions
The Joint Position Statement (12/10/2014)

Joint Position

- Limits Exp/Susp
- Public & Private
- Recs to States
- ECMHC
# ACEs & Preschool Expulsion/Suspension

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Risk Factor</th>
<th>OR</th>
<th>p-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Domestic Violence</td>
<td>OR = 10.6</td>
<td>p &lt; .001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Mental Illness</td>
<td>OR = 9.8</td>
<td>p &lt; .001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adult Substance Abuse</td>
<td>OR = 4.8</td>
<td>p &lt; .001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victim/Witness of Violence</td>
<td>OR = 4.5</td>
<td>p &lt; .01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poverty</td>
<td>OR = 3.9</td>
<td>p &lt; .001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parental Divorce</td>
<td>OR = 3.3</td>
<td>p &lt; .001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parental Incarceration</td>
<td>OR = 3.0</td>
<td>p &lt; .01</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Is it possible that implicit biases about our boys and especially our black boys may play a role?
RIDDLE
Implicit Bias in Preschool

Jan 2015 – Funding
(Thanks, W.K. Kellogg Foundation!)

Nov 2015 – Collected Data

Sep 2016 – Released Report
## Participants ($N = 132; 94\% \text{ Female}$)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Classroom teacher</td>
<td>68.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center director</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student teachers</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (e.g., combination of professional roles)</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Center type</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Faith-affiliated program</td>
<td>22.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School-based PreK</td>
<td>17.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not-for-profit</td>
<td>11.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head Start</td>
<td>8.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For profit</td>
<td>7.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (e.g., independent school, special education)</td>
<td>31.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher Race</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>66.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>22.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teaching Experience</th>
<th>$M$</th>
<th>$SD$</th>
<th>Min</th>
<th>Max</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Years working at current location</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years working in early education</td>
<td>11.0</td>
<td>9.10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Which child required the most of your attention?

Please remember the letter of the child who you believe required the most of your attention.
Vignette Study

Same story, manipulated child sex/race:

DeShawn, Latoya, Jake, Emily

Pretend this child is in your classroom

Family Background or No Family Background
Las Vegas, Nevada – Feb 1, 2018
Early Childhood Mental Health Consultation: Results of a Statewide Random-Controlled Evaluation

S. Gilliam, A. Mosquini, C. Reys

Objective: Despite recent federal recommendations calling for increased funding for early childhood mental health consultation (ECMHC) as a means to decrease preventable outcomes, no randomized-controlled evaluation using the framework of intervention has been reported in the scientific literature. This study is the first attempt to isolate the effects of ECMHC for enhancing classroom quality, decreasing internalized and behavior problems, and decreasing the likelihood of expulsion of children in early childhood classrooms.

Method: The sample consisted of 75 target children (4-9 years old) in 14 preschool classrooms and teachers randomly assigned to receive ECMHC through Connecticut's statewide Early Childhood Consultation Partnership (ECCP), or wait-list control treatment. Before randomization, teachers selected 7 target children in each classroom whose behavior most prompted the request for ECFF. Evaluation measurements were collected before and after treatment, and child behavior and social skills and overall quality of the classroom environment were assessed. Hierarchical linear modeling was used to evaluate the effectiveness of ECFF and to account for the nested structure of the study design.

Results: Children who received ECFF had significantly lower rates of hyperactivity, externalization, internalization behaviors, problem behaviors, and total problems compared with children in the control group after controlling for gender and prior treatment. No effects were found on likelihood of expulsion and quality of classroom environment.

Conclusions: ECFF resulted in significant decreases across several domains of teacher-rated externalizing and problem behaviors and a viable and promising and effective means for reducing mental health services into early childhood settings. Clinical and policy implications for ECFF are discussed.

Key words: Early childhood mental health consultation, preschool children, behavioral outcomes, early childhood education, preschool education.

Department of Health and Human Services and the US Department of Education to highlight evidence-based approaches to decrease suspensions and expulsions in all US early care and education programs. The present study is the first true randomized-controlled evaluation designed to isolate the effects of ECMHC on decreasing the challenging behaviors that often lead to expulsions, thus addressing a historically underinvested area.

Severe behavior problems during the preschool years are meaningful predictors of behavior problems, peer peer standing, and academic difficulties during school age.14,15 Early interventions can help prevent the development of more severe behavior problems in children with autism spectrum disorders.16 No randomized-controlled evaluation using the framework of intervention has been reported in the scientific literature. This study is the first attempt to isolate the effects of ECMHC for enhancing classroom quality, decreasing internalized and behavior problems, and decreasing the likelihood of expulsion of children in early childhood classrooms.

Method: The sample consisted of 75 target children (4-9 years old) in 14 preschool classrooms and teachers randomly assigned to receive ECMHC through Connecticut's statewide Early Childhood Consultation Partnership (ECCP), or wait-list control treatment. Before randomization, teachers selected 7 target children in each classroom whose behavior most prompted the request for ECFF. Evaluation measurements were collected before and after treatment, and child behavior and social skills and overall quality of the classroom environment were assessed. Hierarchical linear modeling was used to evaluate the effectiveness of ECFF and to account for the nested structure of the study design.

Results: Children who received ECFF had significantly lower rates of hyperactivity, externalization, internalization behaviors, problem behaviors, and total problems compared with children in the control group after controlling for gender and prior treatment. No effects were found on likelihood of expulsion and quality of classroom environment.

Conclusions: ECFF resulted in significant decreases across several domains of teacher-rated externalizing and problem behaviors and a viable and promising and effective means for reducing mental health services into early childhood settings. Clinical and policy implications for ECFF are discussed.

Key words: Early childhood mental health consultation, preschool children, behavioral outcomes, early childhood education, preschool education.
Quality Measurement: The CHILD & Equity

Climate of Healthy Interactions for Learning & Development

Consultant’s Guide to the CHILD Tool
Pilot Version

Chin R. Reyes, Ph.D., & Walter S. Gilliam, Ph.D.
with Carla Harvitz, Ed.D.

Yale Child Study Center
Edward Zigler Center in Child Development & Social Policy
Policy by the Numbers

26 States Acting
15 States with Bans
1.6 Million Preschoolers Protected
Why Care about Disparities in Early Expulsion?
Social Justice & Civil Rights Are Often Matters of Access
YOU HAVE the FREEDOM to VOTE.
Acknowledgements

THE TEAM

Amalia Londono Tobon, MD
Maria Accavitti, MA
Chin Reyes, PhD
Angela Maupin, PhD

Generous Support from the W.K. Kellogg Foundation
Thank You! To Read More...

rwjf.ws/2erCYjN

Random-Controlled Evaluation of ECMHC (Sep 2016)
bit.ly/2kwRnja; bit.ly/2kwP8MS

Yale Preschool Implicit Bias Study (Sep 2016)
bit.ly/2erxzsp

National Academy of Sciences (Oct 2016)
bit.ly/2ff5G5t

Preschool Suspension & Expulsion Timeline
bit.ly/2erztd8

Follow me on Twitter: @WalterGilliam